

Research Terms of Reference

Research Cycle Title: **Bread & Wheat Flour Supply Chain Assessment**

Research Cycle ID: **LBY1903**

Country: **Libya**

May 2020
Version 3

REACH Informing
more effective
humanitarian action

1. Executive Summary

Country of intervention	Libya				
Type of Emergency	<input type="checkbox"/>	Natural disaster	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Conflict	
Type of Crisis	<input type="checkbox"/>	Sudden onset	<input type="checkbox"/>	Slow onset	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Protracted
Mandating Body/ Agency	World Food Programme (WFP)				
Project Code	14iAKA				
Overall Research Timeframe (from research design to final outputs / M&E)	04/09/2019 to 31/12/2019				
Research Timeframe Add planned deadlines (for first cycle if more than 1)	1. Start collect data: 14/11/2019		5. Preliminary presentation: TBC		
	2. Data collected: 05/12/2019		6. Outputs sent for validation: TBC		
	3. Data analysed: 19/12/2019		7. Outputs published: TBC		
	4. Data sent for validation: 20/12/2019		8. Final presentation: TBC		
Number of assessments	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Single assessment (one cycle)			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multi assessment (more than one cycle)			
Humanitarian milestones Specify what will the assessment inform and when e.g. The shelter cluster will use this data to draft its Revised Flash Appeal;	Milestone		Deadline		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Donor plan/strategy	31/12/2019 All agreed outputs will be shared with WFP.		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Inter-cluster plan/strategy	__/__/____		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Cluster plan/strategy	01/03/2019 Findings will be used to help inform Libya Cash and Markets Working Group strategy.		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	NGO platform plan/strategy	__/__/____		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Other (Specify):	__/__/____		
Audience Type & Dissemination Specify who will the assessment inform and how you will disseminate to inform the audience	Audience type		Dissemination		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Strategic		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General Product Mailing (e.g. mail to NGO consortium; HCT participants; Donors)		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Programmatic		<input type="checkbox"/> Cluster Mailing (Education, Shelter and WASH) and presentation of findings at next cluster meeting		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Operational		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Presentation of findings (e.g. at HCT meeting; Cluster meeting)		
	<input type="checkbox"/> [Other, Specify]		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Website Dissemination (Relief Web & REACH Resource Centre)		

Detailed dissemination plan required	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes	X	No
General Objective	To understand the dynamics of the bread and wheat flour market system in Libya and how it has been affected by conflict since 2014, in order to help develop an evidence-based response and provide support to food security sector interventions in Libya.			
Specific Objective(s)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To map the supply chain for bread and wheat flour to understand current market dynamics and processes. 2. To understand the current capacity and functionality of each market actor in the bread and wheat flour supply chain. 3. To understand what caused the mid-2018 bread crisis and what measures could be taken to avoid supply chain volatility in the future. 4. To understand the role played by bakeries in the bread and wheat supply chain and the challenges they currently face. 5. To understand the way the wider market environment impacts the bread and wheat flour supply chain. 6. To understand what barriers (if any) consumers face when accessing the bread and wheat flour market, and to gather information on whether consumption patterns have changed. 7. To allow for the identification of conflict-sensitive solutions to assist and alleviate populations affected by food shortages. 8. To support WFP by providing evidence to help develop their programming in relation to food assistance through a conflict-sensitive lens that takes account of the multiple dynamics that contribute to supply chain volatility. 			
Research Questions	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What are the current dynamics of the bread and wheat flour supply chain and how are they affected by the conflict? How does this compare to the end of the bread crisis (mid-2018)? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. What is the current structure/organisation of the bread and wheat flour supply chain? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. How has this changed as a result of ongoing conflict? b. What is the current market environment, and how has this affected the bread and wheat supply chain? Assess the following areas: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Conflict; ii. Divided government; iii. The liquidity crisis; iv. Parallel currency exchange; v. The black market/shadow economy; vi. Corruption. <p>How does this compare to the end of the bread crisis?</p> c. What rules, regulations and policies impact on the bread and wheat supply chain currently? d. What is the current situation for supply chain actors, in terms of: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Supply; ii. Infrastructure and transportation; iii. Labour; iv. Inputs and equipment; v. Functionality and capacity; vi. Subsidised goods; vii. Liquidity and pricing. <p>How does this compare to the end of the bread crisis?</p> 			

	2. Can consumers access bread and what barriers (if any) do they face? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> What physical barriers (if any) do consumers face? What financial barriers (if any) do consumers face? What are the current availability and price of bread and wheat flour? How have consumption patterns changed since 2018? 3. What types of response are appropriate to help alleviate issues with the bread and wheat flour supply chain, and what would be their likely consequence? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> What are the main weaknesses or vulnerabilities in the bread and wheat flour supply chain? 																				
Geographic Coverage	Key urban areas ¹ across Libya to provide indicative information on the state of the supply chain in different parts of the country. These locations will be: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Tripoli (West); Misrata (West); Benghazi (East); Alkufra (East); Sebha (South); al Jufra (South) 																				
Secondary data sources	Secondary data sources will include previous reports by REACH relating to cash, markets, supply chains and the impact of the crisis as well as multi-sector and rapid assessments; market assessments and analysis by external organisations, especially by WFP; and, recent political literature concerning Libya's evolving war/conflict/shadow economy.																				
Population(s) <i>Select all that apply</i>	<table border="1"> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>IDPs in camp</td><td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>IDPs in informal sites</td></tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>IDPs in host communities</td><td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>IDPs [Other, Specify]</td></tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>Refugees in camp</td><td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Refugees in informal sites</td></tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Refugees in host communities</td><td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Refugees [Other, Specify]</td></tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Host communities</td><td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>[Other, Specify]</td></tr> </table>	<input type="checkbox"/>	IDPs in camp	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	IDPs in informal sites	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	IDPs in host communities	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	IDPs [Other, Specify]	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refugees in camp	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Refugees in informal sites	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Refugees in host communities	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Refugees [Other, Specify]	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Host communities	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Other, Specify]
<input type="checkbox"/>	IDPs in camp	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	IDPs in informal sites																		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	IDPs in host communities	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	IDPs [Other, Specify]																		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Refugees in camp	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Refugees in informal sites																		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Refugees in host communities	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Refugees [Other, Specify]																		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Host communities	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Other, Specify]																		
Stratification <i>Select type(s) and enter number of strata</i>	<table border="1"> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Geographical #: 6 urban centres Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</td><td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>Group #: _ _ _ Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</td><td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>[Other Specify] #: _ _ Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</td></tr> </table>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Geographical #: 6 urban centres Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/>	Group #: _ _ _ Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Other Specify] #: _ _ Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No														
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Geographical #: 6 urban centres Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/>	Group #: _ _ _ Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Other Specify] #: _ _ Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No																
Data collection tool(s)	<table border="1"> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>Structured (Quantitative)</td><td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Semi-structured (Qualitative)</td></tr> </table>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Structured (Quantitative)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Semi-structured (Qualitative)																
<input type="checkbox"/>	Structured (Quantitative)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Semi-structured (Qualitative)																		
	<table border="1"> <tr> <th>Sampling method</th><th>Data collection method</th></tr> <tr> <td> X Purposive X Snowballing <input type="checkbox"/> [Other, Specify] </td><td> X Key informant interview (Target #): 270 <input type="checkbox"/> Individual interview (Target #): _ _ _ _ <input type="checkbox"/> Focus group discussion (Target #): _ _ _ _ <input type="checkbox"/> [Other, Specify] (Target #): _ _ _ _ </td></tr> </table>	Sampling method	Data collection method	X Purposive X Snowballing <input type="checkbox"/> [Other, Specify]	X Key informant interview (Target #): 270 <input type="checkbox"/> Individual interview (Target #): _ _ _ _ <input type="checkbox"/> Focus group discussion (Target #): _ _ _ _ <input type="checkbox"/> [Other, Specify] (Target #): _ _ _ _																
Sampling method	Data collection method																				
X Purposive X Snowballing <input type="checkbox"/> [Other, Specify]	X Key informant interview (Target #): 270 <input type="checkbox"/> Individual interview (Target #): _ _ _ _ <input type="checkbox"/> Focus group discussion (Target #): _ _ _ _ <input type="checkbox"/> [Other, Specify] (Target #): _ _ _ _																				
Semi-structured data collection tool (s) # 1 <i>Select sampling and data collection method and specify target # interviews</i>																					
Data management platform(s)	<table border="1"> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>IMPACT</td><td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>UNHCR</td></tr> </table>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	IMPACT	<input type="checkbox"/>	UNHCR																
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	IMPACT	<input type="checkbox"/>	UNHCR																		
Expected output type(s)	<table border="1"> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>Situation overview #:</td><td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Report # 1</td><td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>Profile #: _ _</td></tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Presentation (Preliminary findings) #: 1</td><td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Presentation (Final) #: 1</td><td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Factsheet #: 6</td></tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>Interactive dashboard #: _</td><td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>Webmap #: _ _</td><td><input type="checkbox"/></td><td>Map #: _ _</td></tr> </table>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Situation overview #:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Report # 1	<input type="checkbox"/>	Profile #: _ _	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Presentation (Preliminary findings) #: 1	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Presentation (Final) #: 1	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Factsheet #: 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	Interactive dashboard #: _	<input type="checkbox"/>	Webmap #: _ _	<input type="checkbox"/>	Map #: _ _		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Situation overview #:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Report # 1	<input type="checkbox"/>	Profile #: _ _																
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Presentation (Preliminary findings) #: 1	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Presentation (Final) #: 1	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Factsheet #: 6																
<input type="checkbox"/>	Interactive dashboard #: _	<input type="checkbox"/>	Webmap #: _ _	<input type="checkbox"/>	Map #: _ _																
Access	<table border="1"> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td><td>Public (available on REACH resource center and other humanitarian platforms)</td></tr> </table>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Public (available on REACH resource center and other humanitarian platforms)																		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Public (available on REACH resource center and other humanitarian platforms)																				

¹ For this assessment, an urban area is defined as a major regional population centre with significant economic activity. Urban areas in different parts of Libya were selected in order to understand the supply chain across the country.

	<input type="checkbox"/>	Restricted (bilateral dissemination only upon agreed dissemination list, no publication on REACH or other platforms)
Visibility Specify which logos should be on outputs	REACH	
	Donor: WFP	
	Coordination Framework: N/A	
	Partners: WFP	

2. Rationale

2.1. Rationale

Armed conflict and political instability have affected over 1.6 million people across Libya.² The highly volatile security situation and protracted conflict, which began in March 2014, has been coupled with a growing monetary and fiscal crisis.³ As a result, access to basic goods and services has become a major challenge as people face decreased purchasing power due to a lack of liquidity and inflated prices.

According to the International Grains Council (IGC), 80% of the Libyan diet is based on wheat.⁴ Therefore, any price fluctuations and disruptions to supply place enormous strain on household expenditure, driving up the price of a Minimum Expenditure Basket (MEB).⁵ An assessment conducted by REACH in 2017 on market systems in Libya confirmed that the wheat flour supply chain had undergone substantial changes since 2014.⁶ As a result of the authorities' inability to provide adequate funds, wheat flour subsidies for bakeries have been abolished throughout the country and wheat imports reduced.⁷ This disruption combined with a general lack of liquidity among the population has led to an estimated 50% decrease in wheat flour consumption since 2014, while bread prices have risen by 300%.⁸ In July 2018, this situation led to bakeries closing in Tripoli and southern Libya and bread shortages reported across the country.⁹ Partially in response to the emerging "bread crisis", in September 2018, the Libyan government approved an economic reform package that helped to reduce the price of key food items and reduced the impact of the liquidity crisis on the population.¹⁰

Apart from an awareness among humanitarian actors that household consumption has fallen in recent years, little is known about the current dynamics of the bread and wheat flour market system or the causes of 2018's "bread crisis". Given how integral wheat is to the Libyan diet and the country's food security, this knowledge gap is of particular concern to humanitarian actors. This assessment aims to alter that situation by providing up-to-date information on the current dynamics of the bread and wheat supply chain, including the functionality and capacity of key market actors, as well as consumer access and consumption patterns. Alongside this, it will also shed light on the drivers behind the July 2018 "bread crisis" to better understand causes and ways of avoiding supply chain volatility in the future. Collectively, this information will help key humanitarian actors to provide durable and effective assistance aimed at alleviating the impact of market disruptions.

² OCHA Humanitarian Needs Overview 2019.

³ World Bank. Libya's Economic Outlook – April 2018 <https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/libya/publication/economic-outlook-april-2018>.

⁴ Q Elfagehia, (2014). An Overview of Grains and Feed Market in Libya (Presentation). 2014 IGC Grains Conference. Accessed on 8 October 2017. Available from <http://sacota.co.za/wp-content/uploads/elfagehia.pdf>.

⁵ The Minimum Expenditure Basket (MEB) represents the minimum culturally adjusted group of items required to support a six-person Libyan household for one month. The cost of the MEB can be used as a proxy for the financial burdens facing households in different locations.

⁶ REACH, Market Systems in Libya: Assessment of the Wheat Flour, Insulin, Tomato and Soap Supply Chains, October 2017.

⁷ Around 90% of Libya's cereal consumption requirements is imported from abroad. The share of local wheat production is low, with only around 10% coming from domestic sources before 2014. FAO (2017) GIEWS Country Brief Libya, 11 May 2017.

⁸ REACH, Market Systems in Libya: Assessment of the Wheat Flour, Insulin, Tomato and Soap Supply Chains, October 2017.

⁹ Reuters, "bread price hike sharpens economic pain for Libyans", July 11 2018

<https://www.reuters.com/article/us-libya-security-economy/bread-price-hike-sharpens-economic-pain-for-libyans-idUSKBN1K22P8>; Libya Herald, "Bread Prices Discussed by Serraj Government As Prices Soar", 9 August <https://www.libyaherald.com/2018/08/09/bread-crisis-discussed-by-serraj-government-as-prices-soar/>

¹⁰ Joint Market Monitoring Initiative, February 2019

The assessment will also contribute to a growing literature on how war economics is driving the country's protracted crisis and worsening the situation for Libyan households.¹¹ As Libya's war has progressed, its economy has been reformed in a way that perpetuates violence, as different armed groups compete for key economic assets, infrastructure and resources.¹² In March 2018, Ghassan Salame, UN Special Envoy for Libya, declared that the most important challenge facing the country was its "shadow economy", including the smuggling of subsidised goods.¹³ The bread and wheat flour market is not immune to these economic changes and previous assessments have revealed widespread smuggling and import fraud within the supply chain.¹⁴ This assessment will provide up-to-date information on these issues, as well as broader findings showing how Libya's economy has been altered by several years of conflict, coupled with the absence of a strong central government.

3. Methodology

3.1 Methodology overview

The assessment will be carried out in partnership with the World Food Programme (WFP), who will provide expert input at each stage. Based on a qualitative methodology, Key Informant Interviews (KII) will be conducted with the key actors involved in the bread and wheat supply chain. These actors have already been identified based on consultations with WFP, secondary data and previous REACH assessments. They include wheat importers, domestic wheat producers, mill owners/workers, bakery owners/workers, retailers, jam'iyat¹⁵ owners/workers, consumers and expert Key Informants (KIs) – such as government officials, academics and economists.

These respondents will be identified using a combination of purposive sampling and snowballing, relying on existing REACH networks as well as the networks of local partner organisations. Bakery owners/workers, retailers, jam'iyat owners/workers and consumers will be identified in each assessed location in order to reveal local dynamics and identify regional variations, whereas wheat importers, domestic wheat producers, mill owners/workers, and expert Key Informants will be identified at a national level, which reflects the nature of their operations.¹⁶

Data will be collected by trained REACH field staff using paper form tools that will have been specifically designed for each respondent group. The interview tools will have open-ended questions, allowing for the collection of detailed information. During the interviews, field staff will take notes, which will later be translated and shared with the Tunis office for analysis to identify themes, commonalities and differences in KI answers. This will feed directly into the production of the factsheets for each assessed location as well as the overall report.

3.2 Population of interest

The assessment aims to provide information on the bread and wheat flour supply chain across Libya and therefore will assess major population centres in each region of the country as they are centres of economic activity that are integral to the supply chain, which responds to the demand provided by their respective populations:

- Tripoli (West);
- Misrata (West);
- Benghazi (East);

¹¹ "Conflict Economies in the Middle East and North Africa", Chatham House (June, 2019); "Libya's War Economy: Predation, Profiteering and State Weakness", Chatham House (April, 2018); "Libya's Shadow Economy", Mercy Corps (April, 2017); "Predatory Economies in Eastern Libya: The Dominant Role of the Libyan National Army", (June, 2019); "Of Tanks and Banks: Stopping a Dangerous Escalation in Libya", International Crisis Group (May, 2019).

¹² Tim Eaton, Christine Cheng, Renad Mansour, Peter Salisbury, Jihad Yazigi and Lina Khatib, "Conflict Economies In the Middle East and North Africa", Chatham House (June 2019).

¹³ "At a glance: Libya's Transformation 2011-2018, political economy, power and legitimacy", Democracy Reporting International, p. 13.

¹⁴ REACH, Market Systems in Libya: Assessment of the Wheat Flour, Insulin, Tomato and Soap Supply Chains, October 2017; Joint Market Monitoring Initiative: January-June 2018 Trends Analysis (September, 2018).

¹⁵ Jamiyat are consumers associations where the population can access subsidised goods provided by the Public Stability Fund (PSF). Prior to the conflict Jamiyat stores were located in every neighbourhood. REACH, "Market Systems in Libya", October 2017. Their current functionality, however, is not fully known.

¹⁶ In the last supply chain assessment, it was found there are only around 10 actors working to import wheat flour in the country and 20 functional mills, working to grind the wheat down to flour. In terms of domestic production, the bulk of Libyan's wheat farms are reportedly located in the South around Sebha, and the vast majority of the country is not arable meaning that not all locations will have wheat farms. REACH, "Market Systems in Libya: Assessments of the Wheat Flour, Insulin, Tomato and Soap Supply Chains", October 2017.

- Alkufra (East);
- Sebha (South);
- al Jufra (South).

The assessment is interested in the different actors involved in the bread and wheat flour supply chain in each urban centre as well as the population (consumers) in those locations who rely on that supply chain in order to access bread and wheat flour, the mainstay of their diet. Alongside this, the assessment is also interested in national-level actors such as wheat importers, mill owners and government officials, in order to understand national-level supply chain dynamics. This approach will allow for an understanding of how both macro- and micro-economic factors impact the supply chain and provide information on each stage of the process, from importation or production through to consumption.

Consumer respondents in four of the six locations will be further divided into three distinct categories in order to provide indicative information on whether access, availability and consumption of bread varies across different population groups within Libya. These groups are:

Remainee/Returnee: Libyans who are living in their normal place of residence/Libyans who were previously displaced but have now returned to their normal place of residence.

Internally Displaced Persons: Libyans who have been displaced for conflict related reasons for more than one month, either within their own town/city or from other parts of the country.

Migrant/Refugees: This term covers all non-Libyans who are residing in Libya, whether they are in transit to Europe or another country, have needed to flee their home countries, or have simply come to work.

Based on the findings of previous MSNAs, Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) and Migrants/Refugees are known to have generally weaker food security than the rest of the population and therefore may face greater challenges to accessing bread. The locations where additional consumer surveys and disaggregation by key population group will take place were selected either because they are experiencing on-going fighting that has caused displacement (Tripoli and Sebha) or they have relatively weak food security when compared to the rest of the country based on the findings of previous MSNAs (al Jufra and Alkufra).¹⁷

3.3 Secondary data review (outline key bibliography/sources you will use and for what).

The secondary data to be used for this assessment covers three broad areas: previous REACH assessments; previous external market assessments and analyses; and literature covering Libya's war/conflict/shadow economy. These are detailed below.

Previous REACH assessments:

- "Market Systems in Libya: Assessment of the Wheat Flour, Insulin, Tomato and Soap Supply Chains" (October, 2017)
- "Joint Market Monitoring Initiative: January-June 2018 Trends Analysis" (September, 2018)
- "Joint Market Monitoring Initiative: Monthly Factsheet" (2017 – present)
- "Desk Review of Cash and Market Studies in Libya" (2017)
- "Effects of the Tripoli Conflict on South Libya" (June 2019)
- "2018 Multi-Sector Needs Assessment" (February 2019)
- "Tripoli Rapid Situation Overview" (April 2019)
- "Murzuq Rapid Situation Overview" (August 2019)

Previous market assessments and analyses:

- "Rapid Markets Assessment: Eastern Libya", WFP (August 2011)
- "Emergency Market Mapping Analysis: Report on the Wheat Flour and Tomato Market Systems, Eastern Libya", WFP (June, 2011)
- "Libya – Food Security: Multi-Cluster Needs Assessment", WFP (December, 2018)
- "Libya Country Economic Review", USAID (January, 2019)

¹⁷ REACH, Libya Multi-Sector Needs Assessment Libya, 2019/2018

- Agriculture and Rural Livelihoods Needs Assessment – Libya, (August 2017)
- “The Quest For Subsidy Reform in Libya”, World Bank (March, 2015)

Literature on the war/conflict/conflict economy

- “Conflict Economies in the Middle East and North Africa”, Chatham House (June, 2019)
- “Libya’s War Economy: Predation, Profiteering and State Weakness, Chatham House (April, 2018)
- “Libya’s Shadow Economy”, Mercy Corps (April, 2017)
- “Predatory Economies in Eastern Libya: The Dominant Role of the Libyan National Army”, (June, 2019)
- “Of Tanks and Banks: Stopping a Dangerous Escalation in Libya”, International Crisis Group (May, 2019)

3.4 Primary Data Collection

Data will be collected through Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) by Arabic-speaking enumerators with eight respondent groups that represent the main actors within the bread and wheat flour supply chain, which are detailed in Table 1 – below. Wheat importers, domestic wheat producers, mill owners and subject matter expert KIIs¹⁸ will be interviewed at the national level to provide information on the national supply chain, whereas bakery owners/workers, retailers, jam’iyat owners/workers, and consumers will be interviewed in each assessed location to understand local supply chain dynamics.

Table 1: Respondent types and target numbers¹⁹

Respondent types and target numbers			
KI type	Level of analysis	Target number per location	Target number national level (overall)
Wheat importers	National		15
Domestic Wheat Producers	National		15
Mill owners/workers	National		15
Wholesalers	Local (all 6 locations)	5	30
Bakery owners/ workers	Local (all 6 locations)	10 (At least 3 bakeries have to be currently non-functioning)	60
Retailers	Local (all 6 locations)	5	30
Jam’iyat owners/workers	Local (all 6 locations)	5	30
Consumers	Local (Tripoli, Sebha, al Jufra and Alkufra)	20 (at least 5 IDPs, Refugees Migrants and / Remeinees)	80
	Local (Misrata and Benghazi)	10	20

¹⁸ Subject matter experts KIIs will be experts on the supply chain such as economists, government officials or academics.

¹⁹ These target numbers were selected based on the resources and time available as well as the need to provide strong indicative information on both national and local supply chain dynamics.

Subject matter expert KIs	National	15
Total		310

Enumerators will conduct face-to-face KIs with bakery owners/workers, retailers, jam'iyat owners/workers and consumers in each of the six assessed locations. For the national-level respondent groups enumerators will also conduct face-to-face KIs where possible. For example, in the case of government officials located in Tripoli. However, in cases where enumerators cannot meet with respondents – for example, with a domestic wheat producer located in an area experiencing security challenges – remote telephone KIs will be carried out.

Respondents will be identified for each category through a mixture of purposive sampling and snowballing. In each assessed location, field teams with strong local knowledge will identify bakeries, shops that sell bread and wheat flour, and jam'iyat stores. These should be spread out across the urban areas in order to speak to different local market actor respondents whose customers come from different neighbourhoods located across the urban area. For consumers, these will be identified through either local networks or enumerators asking retailers, bakers or jam'iyat stores owners if they can interview some of their customers. For national-level respondents, these will be identified through REACH and partner organisation's existing networks as well as through snowballing. Certain key individuals (such as academics interviewed as expert KIs or government ministers) will be identified and contacted through secondary data review.²⁰

Data will be collected using semi-structured interviews with open-ended answers allowing for the capture of detailed information. A separate tool will be created for each respondent type asking questions geared specifically to them, and their role within the supply chain – these are detailed in table 2, below. The tools will build on those used in the previous supply chain assessments as well as consultations with WFP, local partners, local staff and secondary data reading. Collectively, these tools will yield detailed information about the current dynamics of the bread and wheat flour supply chain from production or importation of wheat through to the purchase and consumption of bread.

Before data collection, all enumerators will have received a comprehensive Arabic-language training covering the purpose of the assessment, the tools, and the key information to be captured. While carrying out KIs each enumerator will take detailed notes using a pre-designed template. Following each interview, these notes will be translated and then shared with the REACH office in Tunis where they will be cleaned and compiled into a centralised dataset, ready for analysis. While data collection is taking place, the assessment officer will be in communication with field officers and enumerators either over Skype or by telephone (at times this may not be possible due to signal or connectivity issues) to monitor the situation and address any issues. At the end of each day of data collection there will be a debrief with enumerators to discuss how the day went and identify any issues with the respondents or the data. If any issues with broader relevance are identified, these will be communicated to all the field teams prior to the next day of data collection. Throughout the data collection process, the notes from previous debriefs will be consulted in order to help identify contradictions or inconsistencies within the responses, so that these issues can be addressed in follow-up calls where necessary. In addition, the debrief notes will be regularly reviewed to determine whether data saturation has been reached and when additional data collection might be necessary.

3.5 Data Processing & Analysis

Following each interview, the notes will be translated and shared with the REACH office in Tunis where they will be cleaned – checked for any inconsistencies, mistakes or lack of clarity – and added to a centralised dataset with separate tabs for each respondent group and each location.

²⁰ Depending on the respondent and their English-language abilities these experts will be interviewed by either field times in Libya or Assessment Officers based in Tunis.

For the analysis, thematic coding will be used to draw themes from the data and make it comparable. In order to expediate this process Atlas Ti software will be used to help identify thematic codes, in order to quantify the contents of respondents' answers and to synthesize what was said. This analysis will then directly feed into the write up of a situation overview for each assessed area and the report of the overall findings. Emphasis will be given to the themes that were raised the most frequently or where there were notable variations in the different KI group's answers across the different locations and respondent groups. The findings yielded by the assessment will not be generalisable to the area of interest and therefore will be treated as indicative only.

4. Roles and responsibilities

Table 3: Description of roles and responsibilities

Task Description	Responsible	Accountable	Consulted	Informed
Research design	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick);	Assessment Specialist (Chris Paci), Country Coordinator (Ayah Al Zayat), WFP, IMPACT HQ	Libya Cash and Markets Working Group (CMWG)
Supervising data collection	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Country Coordinator (Ayah Al Zayat)	WFP
Data processing (checking, cleaning)	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Country Coordinator (Ayah Al Zayat), IMPACT HQ	WFP
Data analysis	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Country Coordinator (Ayah Al Zayat), IMPACT HQ	WFP, Assessment Specialist (Chris Paci)
Output production	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Assessment Specialist (Chris Paci), Country Coordinator (Ayah Al Zayat), WFP, IMPACT HQ	
Dissemination	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Country Coordinator (Ayah Al Zayat), WFP	Libya Cash and Markets Working Group (CMWG)
Monitoring & Evaluation	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)	Country Coordinator (Ayah Al Zayat),	WFP, Assessment Specialist (Chris Paci), , IMPACT HQ

<i>Lessons learned</i>	<i>Assessment Officer (Edward Beswick)</i>	<i>Assessment</i>	<i>Country</i>	<i>WFP, IMPACT HQ</i>
		<i>Officer (Edward Beswick)</i>	<i>Coordinator (Ayah Al Zayat),</i>	

5. Data Analysis Plan²¹

Research Questions	SUBQ#	Data collection method	Sub-research question group	Sub-research Question	Questionnaire QUESTION	Probes	Key disaggregations
	A.1.	KI Interviews with all respondent groups.	Key characteristics	Enumerator Unique ID	Enumerator Unique ID	N/A	
	A.2.	KI Interviews with all respondent groups.	Key characteristics	Key Informant name	What is the name of the key informant?	N/A	
	A.3	KI Interviews with all respondent groups.	Key characteristics	Telephone number	What is the telephone number of the key informant?	N/A	
	A.8.	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Key characteristics	Name of business	What is the name of the business?	N/A	
	A.3.	KI Interviews with all respondent groups.	Key characteristics	Location	In what neighbourhood is the respondent's business located/does the respondent live?	N/A	
	A.4	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill	Key characteristics	Type of business	(1) private (run by private individuals for profit), (2) public (run by the authorities using public money)	N/A	

²¹ **Clarifications given at the start of tool:** "Throughout the interview there are questions that refer to the past and ask how things have changed. Whenever I refer to 2014, I am referring to the current conflict, starting from May 2014; and, whenever I refer to the end of the bread crisis, I am referring to the end of the period when flour was not available which caused many bakeries to close down. The supply chain is the network of actors, resources and processes involved in the production, importation, transportation, distribution and consumption of bread and wheat flour."

		Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat					
	A.7.	KI Interview with consumers.	Key characteristics	Size of the respondent's household (consumers)	(For consumers) How many people live in your household?	N/A	
	A.8	KI Interview with consumers.	Key Characteristics	Population group of respondents	Population group of interviewees: (1) Returnee/Remainee , (2) Internally Displaced Person (IDPs) , (3) Migrant/Refugee ²²	N/A	
What are the current dynamics of the bread and wheat flour supply chain and how are they affected by the conflict? How does this compare to the end of the bread crisis in 2018?	B.1.	KI Interviews, secondary data	Market Mapping	What is the current structure/ organization of the bread and wheat flour supply chain? How has this changed as a result of the ongoing conflict?	<i>Research question to be mostly answered through overall findings and secondary data rather than specific questionnaire questions.</i>		Time period
	B.2.	KI Interviews with Wheat Flour Importers, secondary data	Market Mapping		Who is involved in the importation of wheat grain and/or wheat flour currently? a. The authorities (West or East). Please specify which institution (i.e. PSF); b. Private companies; c. Matahan (The joint stock national company for flour mills and fodder); d. Other, please specify <ul style="list-style-type: none"> For each actor mentioned, what role do they play? How has this changed as a result of the conflict? 		Time period
	B.3.	KI Interviews with Mill	Market Mapping		Since 2014 have new actors become involved in the management and/or control of the mill network in Libya? Yes/No	Armed groups, private companies, new authorities.	Time period, location.

²² These are defined above in the methodology section and in the tools themselves for enumerators.

		Owners, secondary data			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If so, who are the new actors involved? • If so, what impact has this had on your business? 		
--	--	------------------------	--	--	--	--	--

	B.5.	KI Interviews, secondary data	The market environment	What is the current market environment, and how does this affect the bread and wheat flour supply chain? How has this changed since the end of the bread crisis?	<i>Research question to be answered through overall findings and secondary data rather than specific questionnaire questions.</i>		Time period; location.
	B.6.	KI Interviews with wheat importers, secondary data	The market environment	What rules, regulations and policies impact on the supply chain currently?	Please explain the current process for importing wheat and/or wheat flour. What are the main steps (probes: purchasing, authorization, shipping, customs, storage)? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has this process changed since the end of the bread crisis? • If so, how? 	Purchasing, authorization, shipping, customs, storage	Time period.
	B.7.	KI Interviews with wheat importers, secondary data	The market environment		How much import tax do you currently pay when importing wheat grain and/or wheat flour? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 	What percentage.	Time period.
	B.8.	KI Interviews with Wheat Importers,	The market environment		Are you aware of any breach of regulations by wheat importers? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If so, what are they? 	Importing empty containers, applying for false invoices,	

		secondary data				letters of credit fraud	
	B.9.	KI Interviews with Wheat Importers, secondary data	The market environment		How do you obtain foreign currency? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> At what rate are you able to obtain foreign currency (probe: official or unofficial)? Is there a maximum amount that you are able to convert? What percentage of your purchases are made at the official exchange rate currently? What percentage of your purchases are made at the unofficial exchange rate currently? 		Time period.
	B.10.	KI Interviews with Wheat Importers, secondary data	The market environment		In September 2018, the authorities introduced a service fee on foreign currency transactions. What impact (if any) has this had on your business?		
	B.11.	KI Interviews with Wheat Importers, secondary data	The market environment		Do you have access to letters of credit? Yes/No <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If no, why not? If yes, please explain step by step the process of obtaining letters of credit How has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 		Time period.
	B.11.	KI Interviews with Wheat Importers	Supply chain dynamics and health	What is the current situation for supply chain actors in terms of supply? How does this	From which countries do you import wheat grain/wheat flour currently? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? Yes/No If yes, which countries did you import wheat grain and/or wheat flour from previously? 	Countries.	Time period

	B.12.	KI Interviews with Wheat Importers	Supply chain dynamics and health	compare to mid-2018?	Where does imported wheat/wheat flour most commonly enter the country? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> What ports or land borders are used? Why are these entry points used? 	Which ports and land borders	Time period.
	B.14.	KI Interviews with Wheat Producers	Supply chain dynamics and health		Where are the wheat farms in Libya that are still operating located? <i>Please provide locations.</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Do some parts of the country depend more on domestically produced wheat than others? Yes/No If so, which parts and why? 	Name regions and locations.	
	B.15.	KI Interviews with Wheat Producers	Supply chain dynamics and health		Which mills buy the wheat you grow? Where are they located? <i>Please provide locations.</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 		Time period; location
	B. 16.	KI Interviews with Mill Owners	Supply chain dynamics and health		Where does the wheat grain you mill come from? Is it domestically produced or imported from abroad? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? If wheat is imported, who imports the wheat you mill? 	Who supplies your wheat?	Time period.
	B. 17.	KI Interviews with Wholesalers, bakers, jamiyat/	Supply chain dynamics and health		Who do you buy wheat flour from? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Who imports the wheat flour you buy? Who mills the wheat flour you buy? Who delivers the wheat flour you buy? Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 	What companies, organizations or people?	Time period, location.
	B. 18.	KI Interviews with retailers	Supply chain dynamics and health		Where does the bread you buy come from? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 		Time period, location.

		KI Interviews with Importers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		Have there been any disruptions to the supply of wheat flour since the end of the bread crisis? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If so, what were these? • If so, what impact did this have on your business? 		Time period, location.
	B. 19.	KI Interviews with Importers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		Since the end of the bread crisis, has demand for wheat flour/wheat grain//bread (1) increased, (2) decreased or (3) stayed the same <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If increase or decrease, what impact has this had? • If increase or decrease, why do you think this is? 		Time period, location.
	B. 20.	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		Does wheat ever go missing in the supply chain (probe: for example, the wheat you sell doesn't arrive at the mill?) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If so, where does it go? • If so, what impact does this have on your business? 		Time period, location.
	B. 21.	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health	What is the current situation for supply chain actors in terms of infrastructure and transport? How does this compare to the	Are there any current problems with the key infrastructure that you depend upon to run your business? Yes/No <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are there problems with irrigation/water supply network infrastructure? • Are there problems with electricity infrastructure? • Are there problems with road infrastructure? If so, what are these problems?	Water, electricity, transport	Location, time period.

				end of the bread crisis?	If so, what impact do they have on your work?		
	B. 22.	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		<p>In what vehicles is wheat grain/flour/bread transported to/from your business/? <i>Please provide make and model.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How is wheat grain/wheat flour/bread stored in those vehicles (<i>probe: in separate bags or in bulk</i>)? Are enough vehicles available to transport the wheat grain/flour/bread? Yes/No If no, why not? 		Location.
	B.23	KI Interviews with importers, producers, mill owners, wholesalers, bakers, retailers, jam'iyat	Supply chain dynamics and health		<p>Does the security situation impact on the transportation of goods currently? (Probes Checkpoints, hijackings/robberies)?</p> <p>How has this changed since the end of the bread crisis?</p>	Checkpoints, hijackings/robberies	Location, time period
	B.24	KI Interviews with importers, producers, mill owners, wholesalers, bakers, retailers, jam'iyat	Supply chain dynamics and health	What is the current situation for supply chain actors in terms of labour? How does this compare to the end of the bread crisis?	<p>Is there sufficient labour available to help to run the business? Yes/No</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If no, what impact does this have? If no, why do you think that is? <p>How has the availability of labour changed over the last five years?</p>		Location, time period
	B.25	KI Interviews with importers, producers,	Supply chain dynamics and health		Where do the people who work in your (insert business type) come from (<i>probe: Libya, Egypt, Chad, Niger</i>)?	Libyan; foreign nationals – Egyptian, Nigerien,	Location; time period

		mill owners, wholesalers, bakers, retailers, jam'iyat			<ul style="list-style-type: none">Has this changed since the last five years?	Chadian, Tunisian etc.	
B.26	KI Interviews with Wheat Producers	Supply chain dynamics and health	What is the current situation for supply chain actors in terms of inputs and equipment? How does this compare to mid-2018?	Has the availability of any of the key materials and equipment you rely on been affected by the conflict since 2014? <ul style="list-style-type: none">If so, how? Has the price of the key materials and equipment been affected by the conflict since 2014? <ul style="list-style-type: none">If so, how? What impact does this have on your business?	Seeds, fertilizer, pesticides, tractors or other equipment	Location, time period.	
B.27	KI Interviews with Bakers and Mill Owners	Supply chain dynamics and health		Do you have any issues currently with the equipment needed to operate your mill/bakery? If so, what are these issues? <ul style="list-style-type: none">If so, how has this changed since the end of the bread crisis?	Issues with maintenance, missing parts	Location, time period.	
B.28	KI Interviews with Bakers and Mill Owners.	Supply chain dynamics and health		Have you experienced fuel shortages since the end of the bread crisis? Yes/No <ul style="list-style-type: none">If so, when?If so, what impact did this have?		Location	
B.29	KI Interviews with Bakers and Mill Owners.	Supply chain dynamics and health		How has the price of fuel changed since the end of the bread crisis? a) increased, b) decreased, c) stayed the same <ul style="list-style-type: none">If increased or decreased, what impact has this had on your business?		Location	
B.30	KI Interviews with wheat importers	Supply chain dynamics and health	What is the current capacity and functionality of supply chain actors? How has this changed since	How many wheat importers are there currently active in Libya (approximately)? <ul style="list-style-type: none">How has this changed since the end of the bread crisis?	.	Time period	
B.31.	KI Interviews with Wheat Importers	Supply chain dynamics and health		How frequently do you import wheat grain/wheat flour into Libya? d. Weekly;	Imports, subsidies, government-run mills, jam'iyat.	Time period	

				the end of the bread crisis?	e. Monthly; f. Every three months; g. Every six months; h. Other. Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis?		
	B.32.	KI Interviews with Wheat Importers.	Supply chain dynamics and health		How much wheat and/or wheat flour do you import each year in metric tonnes? • Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis?		Time period.
	B.33	KI Interviews with Wheat Producers.	Supply chain dynamics and health		How many wheat farms are there currently operational in Libya (approximately)? If respondent is unsure, ask: <i>how many wheat farms are there currently operational in your area? Please specify answer in notes.</i> • How has this changed since the end of the bread crisis?		Time period.
	B.34	KI Interviews with Wheat Producers.	Supply chain dynamics and health		How many acres of wheat will you have planted this year (2019)? • How does this compare to last year (2018)		Time period.
	B.35	KI Interviews with Mill Owners	Supply chain dynamics and health		Where are the mills functioning currently located in Libya? If not known, ask where the functioning mills are located in the respondent's area. Please provide locations and numbers.		
	B.36	KI Interviews with Mill Owners	Supply chain dynamics and health		At full capacity, how much wheat grain can your facilities mill on a daily basis (in metric tonnes)? • Currently, on an average day, approximately how much wheat do you process		
	B.37	KI Interviews with Wholesalers	Supply chain dynamics and health		How many wheat flour wholesalers are currently operating in (location)? • How has this number changed since the end of the bread crisis? (1) Increased;		Location, time period.

					(2) Decreased; (3) Stayed the same.		
	B.38	KI Interviews with Bakers.	Supply chain dynamics and health		<p>Did bakeries close down in [assessed location] as a result of the bread crisis? Yes/No</p> <p>a. If so, why? <i>Respondents can select more than one answer.</i></p> <p>i. Lack of funds;</p> <p>ii. Lack of demand;</p> <p>iii. Lack of ingredients;</p> <p>iv. Lack of labour;</p> <p>v. Lack of equipment;</p> <p>vi. Damage to infrastructure;</p> <p>vii. Damage to bakery;</p> <p>viii. Shortages of fuel;</p> <p>ix. Other, please specify.</p> <p>b. If so, approximately what percentage of bakeries in [assessed location] closed down as a result of the bread crisis?</p> <p>c. Approximately, of those that closed down, what is the percentage of bakeries in [assessed location] that reopened? When did they start reopening?</p>		Location, location.
	B.38	KI Interviews with Bakers.	Supply chain dynamics and health		<p>Currently, are bakeries open but operating at reduced capacity in [assessed location] as a result of the bread crisis? Yes/No</p> <p>a. If so, how have they reduced their operations? <i>Tick as many answers as apply, and please explain you answers.</i></p> <p>i. Reduced production;</p> <p>ii. Reduced working hours;</p> <p>iii. Reduced wages;</p> <p>iv. Reduced staff;</p> <p>v. Reduced range of products sold;</p>		Location.

					<p>vi. Other, please specify.</p> <p>b. If so, why have they reduced their operations? <i>Respondents can pick more than one answer.</i></p> <p>vii. Lack of funds;</p> <p>viii. Lack of demand;</p> <p>ix. Lack of ingredients;</p> <p>x. Lack of labour;</p> <p>xi. Damage to infrastructure;</p> <p>xii. Damage to bakery;</p> <p>xiii. Shortages of fuel;</p> <p>xiv. Other, please specify.</p>		
	B.39	KI Interviews with Bakers.	Supply chain dynamics and health		<p>What quantities of wheat flour do you use on an average day (in KGs)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 		Location.
	B.40	KI Interviews with Jam'iyat.			<p>Are any Jam'iyat still operating in (location)? Yes/No</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If so, what percentage of Jam'iyat (when compared to pre-2014 levels) are still operating? 		Location.
	B.41.	KI Interviews with Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		<p>If Jam'iyat stores have stopped operating in your neighbourhood, why have they stopped? <i>Respondents can select more than one answer.</i></p> <p>i. Lack of supplies;</p> <p>ii. Lack of demands;</p> <p>iii. Lack of labour;</p> <p>iv. Lack of funds;</p> <p>v. Changes in government policy;</p> <p>vi. Other, please specify.</p> <p>If so, when approximately did they close down? <i>Respondents can select more than one answer.</i></p> <p>i. 2019;</p> <p>ii. 2018;</p> <p>iii. 2017;</p>		Location.

					iv. 2016; v. 2015; vi. 2014; vii. Before 2014		
	B.42	KI Interviews with Importers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		If imports/supply of wheat grain/flour were to stop today, how long would your current overall stores of wheat flour last to satisfy current demand? a. Less than one month; b. One month; c. Two months; d. Three months; e. Six months; f. More than six months; g. Other, please specify		Location.
	B.43	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		How has your capacity to grow/sell/make bread/wheat grain/flour changed since the end of the bread crisis? (1) increased, (2) decreased, (3) stayed the same • If 1 or 2, why?		Location, time period.
	B.44	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		How do you see your capacity to make/sell/make bread/wheat grain/flour changing in the next year? (1)increasing, (2) decreasing, (3) staying the same • If 1 or 2, why?		Location

	B.45	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		If you had to scale up your operations, would you be able to respond to a 50 per cent increase in demand for bread? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If no, why 		Location
	B.46	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		If you had to scale up your operations, would you be able to respond to a 50 per cent increase in demand for bread? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If no, why 		
	B. 47	KI Interviews with Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health	What is the current situation for supply chain actors in terms of subsidised goods?	Among the population, who is able to access subsidized goods from the Jam'iyat stores? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 	Libyans, Migrants/Refugees, IDPs	Location, time period.
	B.48	KI Interviews with Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		How do they access them? Please describe the process for purchasing goods in a Jam'iyat store. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 		Location, time period.
	B.49	KI Interviews with Bakeries.	Supply chain dynamics and health		Does your bakery have access to subsidized wheat flour? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If so, what percentage of the flour you use is subsidized? If so, has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 		Location, time period.

	B.50	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Bakers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		What role do the authorities play in the pricing of wheat grain/wheat flour/bread currently?		Location
	B.51	KI Interviews with producers, mill owners and bakers			Do you receive any other support from the government? If so, what kind of support?	Subsidized fuel, subsidized equipment	Location
	B.52	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health	What is the situation for supply chain actors in terms of liquidity and pricing?	How do you pay your suppliers? Respondent can select more than one answers. a. Cash; If in cash, are you able to regularly access enough cash to make your payments? • If no, how do you respond to these issues? b. Bank transfers; c. Cheque; d. Credit; e. Other; • What challenges (if any) do you face when paying your suppliers?		Location.
	B.53	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		Have you faced liquidity issues since the end of the bread crisis? • If so, when was this? • If so, what impact did this have?		Location.

	B.54	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Bakers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		At what price do you currently buy wheat grain/wheat flour in LYD?		Location.
	B.55	KI Interviews with Importers, Producers, Mill Owners, Wholesalers, Retailers and Jam'iyat.	Supply chain dynamics and health		At what price do you currently sell wheat grain/wheat flour/bread in LYD?		Location.
		KI Interviews with bakers and retailers.	Supply chain dynamics and health		With 1 LYD how many pieces of bread can a consumer buy in your bakery/shop? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 		
2. Can the population access bread and wheat flour products and what barriers (e.g. such as physical barriers or financial), if any, do they face when doing so?	C.1	KI Interviews with consumers.	Market barriers	What barriers (if any) do consumers face when accessing bread? How does this compare to mid-2018?	Do you currently face any barriers to physically accessing the shops and bakeries where you normally buy bread? (1) Yes, (2) No If yes, what are these barriers? <i>Respondent can pick more than one answer. Please provide an explanation below for each barrier selected and how long this has prevented you from accessing the market.</i> i. Threat of violence; ii. Fear of arrest or harassment by authorities or armed groups;		Location; population group.

				<p>iii. Market place closed;</p> <p>iv. Lack of transport;</p> <p>v. Other, please specify.</p> <p>If yes, do these barriers prevent you from being able to buy the amount of bread you would normally?</p>		
	C.2.	KI Interviews with consumers.	Market Barriers	<p>Are there any social groups that face difficulties physically accessing bakeries and shops to buy bread in your area?</p> <p>a. Refugees and migrants;</p> <p>b. IDPs;</p> <p>c. Women;</p> <p>d. Members of certain ethnic or tribal groups;</p> <p>e. Other, please specify</p> <p>f. No group faces specific challenges.</p> <p>• If yes, please explain why</p>		Location.
	C.3.	KI Interviews with consumers.	Market Barriers	<p>Do you currently face any financial barriers to buying bread? Yes/No</p> <p>a. Items are too expensive;</p> <p>b. Lack of cash to buy items;</p> <p>c. Insufficient income to be able to afford items.</p> <p>d. Other, please specify</p> <p>i. If so, do these barriers prevent you from being able to buy the amount of bread you would normally?</p>		Location and population group.
	C.3.	KI Interviews with consumers.	Market Barriers	<p>Have you faced any financial barriers to buying bread since the end of the bread crisis? Yes/No</p> <p>e. Items are too expensive;</p> <p>f. Lack of cash to buy item;</p>		Location and population group.

					<p>g. Insufficient income to be able to afford items;</p> <p>h. Other, please specify</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If so, when was this? If so, did these barriers prevent you from being able buy the amount of bread you would normally? Yes/No 		
	C.4.	KI Interviews with consumers.	Market Barriers		<p>Are there any social groups that face financial barriers to buying bread in your area?</p> <p>a. Refugees and migrants;</p> <p>b. IDPs;</p> <p>c. Women;</p> <p>d. Members of certain ethnic or tribal groups;</p> <p>e. Other, please specify</p> <p>f. No group faces specific challenges.</p> <p>i. If yes, please explain why?</p>		Location.
	C.5.	KI Interviews with consumers.	Market Barriers		<p>How do you pay for bread:</p> <p>a. Cash</p> <p>b. Wire transfer:</p> <p>c. Mobile money;</p> <p>d. On credit;</p> <p>e. Other, please specify?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Has this changed since the end of the bread crisis years? If so, how? 	Lack of cash; very high prices.	Location and population group.
	C.6.	KI Interviews with consumers.	Availability	What is the current availability, price and quality of bread for consumers in the assessed areas?	<p>From which types of shop do you buy bread?</p> <p>a. Bakery;</p> <p>b. Supermarket;</p> <p>c. Mini-market;</p> <p>d. Central market (fundek);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Other, please specify. 		Location and population group.
	C.7.	KI Interviews with consumers.	Availability		<p>Have the shops or bakeries you buy your bread from changed since the end of the bread crisis? Yes/No</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If yes, why? 		Locations and population group.

	C.8.	KI Interviews with consumers.	Availability	How has this changed since the end of the bread crisis?	<p>Is bread currently available in the shops and bakeries where you normally buy it?</p> <p>a. Yes b. No</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How has the availability of bread changed since the end of the bread crisis? <p>a. Increased b. Decreased c. Stayed the same</p> Has there been any time since the end of the bread crisis when bread has not been available or was hard to obtain? <p>a. If so, when was this? Please provide month(s) and year. b. If so, what impact did it have on your food consumption?</p> 		Location and population group.
	C.9	KI Interviews with consumers.	Availability		<p>Are you satisfied with the quality of bread on the market currently? (1) Yes, (2) No</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If no, why not? 		Location and population group.
	C.10	KI Interviews with consumers.	Availability		<p>How has the quality of bread changed since the end of the bread crisis?</p> <p>Increased, (2) Decreased, (3) Stayed the same</p>		Location and population group.
	C.11	KI Interviews with consumers.	Availability		<p>With one LYD, how many pieces of bread can you currently buy from the shop/bakery where you normally purchase the item?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How has this changed since the end of the bread crisis? 		Location and population group.
	C.12	KI Interviews with consumers.	Availability		<p>In terms of your overall food budget, how has the proportion spent on bread changed since the end of the bread crisis?</p> <p>a. Increased; b. Decreased; c. Stayed the same.</p>		Location and population group.

	C.13	KI Interviews with consumers.	Consumption	Have consumption patterns changed since the start of the conflict?	<p>In the past seven days, on how many days have you eaten bread?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. 0; b. 1; c. 2; d. 3; e. 4; f. 5; g. 6; h. 7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> On the days where you ate bread, how many times on average did you consume it? In the past seven days, how much did you spend on bread (LYD)? 		Location and population group.
	C.14	KI Interviews with consumers.	Consumption		<p>How has your bread consumption changed since the end of the bread crisis?</p> <p>(1) Increased (2) decreased (3) stayed the same</p> <p>If 1 or 2, why has it changed?</p> <p>If 2, what alternate foods (probe: pasta, couscous, rice and potatoes) do you rely on?</p> <p>If 2, what would allow you to consume the amount of bread you would like to?</p>	Pasta, couscous, rice and potatoes	Location and population group.
	C.15	KI Interviews with consumers.	Consumption		<p>How do you see your bread consumption (from a nutritional point of view)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. I eat too much bread; b. I eat enough bread; c. I don't eat enough bread 		Location and population group.
	C.16	KI Interviews with consumers.	Preferences	What are consumer preferences with regard to bread?	<p>Do you prefer wheat flour that is domestically milled or imported from abroad? Please explain your choice.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Domestically milled b. Milled abroad 	Please explain your choice.	Location and population group.

	C.15	KI Interviews with consumers.	Preferences		<p>Do you ever buy wheat flour to make your own bread?</p> <p>a. If so, why? Please explain your answer</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Because you prefer to bake your own bread; ii. Because bread is not available; iii. Because bread is too expensive; iv. Because bread is of a low quality; v. Because it is hard to access places where bread is sold; 		Location and population group.
	C.17	KI Interviews with consumers.	Preferences		<p>Do you ever buy wheat flour to make your own bread?</p> <p>b. If so, why? Please explain your answer</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Because you prefer to bake your own bread; ii. Because bread is not available; iii. Because bread is too expensive; iv. Because bread is of a low quality; v. Because it is hard to access places where bread is sold; 		Location and population group.
	C.18	KI Interviews with consumers.	Preferences		What percentage of the bread you consume is homemade?		Location and population group.

	C.19	KI Interviews with consumers.	Preferences		Has your consumption of homemade bread changed since the end of the bread crisis? i. (1) Increased ii. (2) decreased iii. (3) stayed the same		Location and population group.
What types of response are appropriate to help alleviate issues with the bread and wheat flour supply chain; and, what would be their likely consequence?	D.1.	KI Interviews	Appropriate Responses	What are the main weaknesses or vulnerabilities in the bread and wheat flour supply chain?	Question answered through assessment.		Location
	D.2.	KI Interviews	Appropriate Responses	What type of response would be appropriate?	Question answered through assessment.		Location

6. Monitoring & Evaluation Plan

IMPACT Objective	External M&E Indicator	Internal M&E Indicator	Focal point	Tool	Will indicator be tracked?
Humanitarian stakeholders are accessing IMPACT products	Number of humanitarian organisations accessing IMPACT services/products Number of individuals accessing IMPACT services/products	# of downloads of x product from Resource Center	Country request to HQ	User_log	X Yes
		# of downloads of x product from Relief Web	Country request to HQ		X Yes
		# of downloads of x product from Country level platforms	Country team		No
		# of page clicks on x product from REACH global newsletter	Country request to HQ		X Yes
		# of page clicks on x product from country newsletter, sendingBlue, bit.ly	Country team		X Yes
		# of visits to x webmap/x dashboard	Country request to HQ		No
IMPACT activities contribute to better program implementation and coordination of the humanitarian response	Number of humanitarian organisations utilizing IMPACT services/products	# references in HPC documents (HNO, SRP, Flash appeals, Cluster/sector strategies)	Country team	Reference_log	<i>HNO, cluster/sector strategies</i>
		# references in single agency documents			The HNO, the HRP, the Cash Working Group strategy, and the Food Security Sector strategy will be checked as well as WFP documentation informed by the assessment.
Humanitarian stakeholders are using IMPACT products	Humanitarian actors use IMPACT evidence/products as a basis for decision making, aid planning and delivery	Perceived relevance of IMPACT country-programs	Country team	Usage_Feed back and Usage_Survey template	Usage surveys to be carried out in January 2020 with WFP and Cash and Markets Working Group partners to assess the utility of the reports and identify areas for improvement.
		Perceived usefulness and influence of IMPACT outputs			
		Recommendations to strengthen IMPACT programs			
	Number of humanitarian				

	documents (HNO, HRP, cluster/agency strategic plans, etc.) directly informed by IMPACT products	Perceived capacity of IMPACT staff Perceived quality of outputs/programs Recommendations to strengthen IMPACT programs			
Humanitarian stakeholders are engaged in IMPACT programs throughout the research cycle	Number and/or percentage of humanitarian organizations directly contributing to IMPACT programs (<i>providing resources, participating to presentations, etc.</i>)	# of organisations providing resources (i.e.staff, vehicles, meeting space, budget, etc.) for activity implementation	Country team	Engagement_log	No
		# of organisations/clusters inputting in research design and joint analysis			Yes
		# of organisations/clusters attending briefings on findings;			Yes

ANNEX 1: METHODOLOGY NOTES

Research Methodology Note

Research Cycle Title: **Bread & Wheat Flour Supply Chain Assessment**

Research Cycle ID: **LBY1903**

Country: **Libya**

May 2020
Version 1

REACH Informing
more effective
humanitarian action

1. Executive Summary

Country of intervention	Libya				
Type of Emergency	<input type="checkbox"/>	Natural disaster	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Conflict	
Type of Crisis	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Sudden onset	<input type="checkbox"/>	Slow onset	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Protracted
Mandating Body/ Agency	The World Food Programme				
Project Code	14iAKA				
Overall Research Timeframe (from research design to final outputs / M&E)	04/05/2020 to 22/05/2020				
Research Timeframe Add planned deadlines (for first cycle if more than 1)	1. Start collect data: 07/05/2020		5. Preliminary presentation: N/A		
	2. Data collected: 11/05/2020		6. Outputs sent for validation: 18/05/2020		
	3. Data analysed: 13/05/2020		7. Outputs published: 22/05/2020		
	4. Data sent for validation: 13/05/2020		8. Final presentation: N/A		
Number of assessments	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Single assessment (one cycle)			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multi assessment (more than one cycle)			
Humanitarian milestones Specify what will the assessment inform and when e.g. The shelter cluster will use this data to draft its Revised Flash Appeal;	Milestone		Deadline		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Donor plan/strategy	22/05/2020 Output will be shared with WFP.		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Inter-cluster plan/strategy	_ _ / _ _ / _ _ _ _		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Cluster plan/strategy	25/05/2020 Findings will be used to help inform Libya Cash and Markets Working Group strategy.		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	NGO platform plan/strategy	_ _ / _ _ / _ _ _ _		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Other (Specify):	_ _ / _ _ / _ _ _ _		
Audience Type & Dissemination Specify who will the assessment inform and how you will disseminate to inform the audience	Audience type		Dissemination		
	X Strategic		X General Product Mailing (e.g. mail to NGO consortium; HCT participants; Donors)		
	X Programmatic		<input type="checkbox"/> Cluster Mailing (Education, Shelter and WASH) and presentation of findings at next cluster meeting		
	X Operational		X Presentation of findings (e.g. at HCT meeting; Cluster meeting)		
	<input type="checkbox"/> [Other, Specify]		X Website Dissemination (Relief Web & REACH Resource Centre)		

		<input type="checkbox"/> [Other, Specify]
Detailed dissemination plan required	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
General Objective	To understand the dynamics of the bread and wheat flour market system, and the causes of potential disruptions to supply in Libya using data already collected by REACH in January 2020 ²³ . Combined with this, REACH will also carry out additional data collection with select Key Informants to understand what impact the COVID-19 Health crisis is having on this vital commodity chain for Libyan food security, in order to help develop an evidence-based response and provide support to interventions in Libya responding to the evolving crisis.	
Specific Objective(s)	<p>9. To map the supply chain for bread and wheat flour to understand current market structure and dynamics (supply and demand), using data already collected by REACH in January 2020.</p> <p>10. To understand the causes of potential disruptions to supply in Bread and Wheat Flour, using data already collected by REACH in January 2020.</p> <p>11. To understand what impact the COVID-19 Health Crisis²⁴ is having on the bread and wheat flour supply chain, relying on new data collected.</p>	
Research Questions	<p>1. What is the structure of the Bread and Wheat Flour Supply Chain in Libya?</p> <p>a. What are the current market dynamics (in terms of supply and demand) and the capacity of different supply chain actors?</p> <p>2. What are the causes of (potential) disruptions to supply?</p> <p>3. What impact has the COVID-19 Health Crisis had on the Bread and Wheat Flour Supply chain?</p>	
Geographic Coverage	The data previously collected was from Benghazi and Al Kufra. Therefore most of the findings will relate to the East of Libya. However, as the assessment concerns a national-level supply chain (issues such as ports-of-entry and importation), the assessment will also produce findings that have national-level relevance.	
Secondary data sources	<p>Secondary data sources will include previous reports by REACH relating to cash, markets, supply chains and the impact of the crisis as well as multi-sector and rapid assessments; market assessments and analysis by external organisations, especially by WFP; and, recent political literature concerning Libya's evolving war/conflict/shadow economy.</p> <p>In addition, new reports related to COVID-19 and its impact in Libya will also be used. In particular, the REACH Rapid Market Assessment and other reports related to the economic impact of COVID-19 and OCHA's regular COVID-19 situation overview reports.</p>	

²³ Data collected for the 'Bread & Wheat Flour Supply Chain assessment' in January 2020. For more information about the assessment, please refer to the full Terms of Reference above.

²⁴ This includes new restrictions such as closure of borders, curfews and bans on inter-city travel imposed by the authorities aimed at limiting the spread of the disease.

<p>The following are examples of the secondary literature that will be used for the purposes of this assessment :</p> <p>Previous REACH assessments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Market Systems in Libya: Assessment of the Wheat Flour, Insulin, Tomato and Soap Supply Chains” (October, 2017) • “Joint Market Monitoring Initiative: January-June 2018 Trends Analysis” (September, 2018) • “2018 Multi-Sector Needs Assessment” (February 2019) <p>Previous market assessments and analyses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Rapid Markets Assessment: Eastern Libya”, WFP (August 2011) • “Agriculture and Rural Livelihoods Needs Assessment” – Libya, FAO (August 2017) • “The Quest For Subsidy Reform in Libya”, World Bank (March, 2015) • “Libya – Fezzan Agriculture and Livelihood Needs Assessment Report” - WFP (March, 2020) <p>New literature on economic impact of COVID-19 in Libya</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Libya COVID-19 Rapid Market Assessment”, REACH (April 2020 – ongoing) • “Libya: COVID-19 Situation Report”, (April 2020 – ongoing) • “Impact of covid-19 on food security & livelihoods”, Libya Food Security Sector (April, 2020) 				
Population(s) ²⁵	X	IDPs in camp	X	IDPs in informal sites
	X	IDPs in host communities	X	IDPs [Other, Specify]
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refugees in camp	X	Refugees in informal sites
	X	Refugees in host communities	X	Refugees [Other, Specify]
	X	Host communities	X	Migrants in host communities Migrants in informal sites
Stratification <i>Select type(s) and enter number of strata</i>	X	Geographical: two urban areas in eastern Libya, plus broader national level dynamics further up the supply chain.	<input type="checkbox"/> Group #: _ _ _ Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> [Other Specify] #: _ _ Population size per strata is known? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Data collection tool(s)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Structured (Quantitative)	X	Semi-structured (Qualitative)
Sampling method			Data collection method	
Semi-structured data collection tool (s) # 1 <i>Select sampling and data collection method and specify target # interviews</i>	X	Purposive	X	Key informant interview (Target #): 15 ²⁶
	X	Snowballing	<input type="checkbox"/>	Individual interview (Target #): _ _ _ _ _
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Other, Specify]	<input type="checkbox"/>	Focus group discussion (Target #): _ _ _ _ _
			<input type="checkbox"/>	[Other, Specify] (Target #): _ _ _ _ _

²⁵ The assessment is focused on the supply chain and macro-level economic dynamics. However, as bread is reportedly a key part of the diet among all population groups in Libya, the findings will have an indirect-relevance to all populations who rely on bread being available and affordable to meet their food needs.

²⁶ This is in addition to the interviews that have already been carried out in January 2020.

Target level of precision if probability sampling	__% level of confidence – N/A		__ +/- % margin of error – N/A	
Data management platform(s)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	IMPACT	<input type="checkbox"/>	UNHCR
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Other, Specify]		
Expected output type(s)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Situation overview #: 01	<input type="checkbox"/>	Report #: __
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Presentation (Preliminary findings) #: __	<input type="checkbox"/>	Presentation (Final) #: __
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Interactive dashboard #: __	<input type="checkbox"/>	Webmap #: __
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Other, Specify] #: __		
Access	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Public (available on REACH resource center and other humanitarian platforms)		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Restricted (bilateral dissemination only upon agreed dissemination list, no publication on REACH or other platforms)		
Visibility <i>Specify which logos should be on outputs</i>	REACH			
	Donor: WFP			
	Coordination Framework: N/A			
	Partners: WFP			

2. Rationale

2.2 Rationale

Armed conflict and political instability have affected over 1.6 million people across Libya.²⁷ The highly volatile security situation and protracted conflict, have been coupled with a growing monetary and fiscal crisis.²⁸ As a result, access to basic goods and services has become a major challenge as people face decreased purchasing power due to a lack of liquidity and inflated prices.

Combined with this protracted crisis, Libya is now facing the consequences of a sudden onset health crisis - the COVID-19 epidemic. The country only has 25 confirmed cases at the time of writing,²⁹ however the authorities have already imposed measures to help combat the spread of the disease, such as curfews, movement restrictions, the closure of all non-essential shops, and the banning of all gatherings.³⁰ Although designed to protect the population from the emerging health crisis, these restrictions, combined with a global economic downturn, have already resulted in a spike in key food prices and a reported shortage of key goods – including wheat.³¹

According to the International Grains Council (IGC), 80% of the Libyan diet is based on wheat.³² Therefore, any price fluctuations and disruptions to supply place enormous strain on household expenditure, driving up the price of a Minimum Expenditure Basket (MEB).³³ An assessment conducted by REACH in 2017 on market systems in Libya confirmed that the wheat flour supply chain had undergone substantial changes since 2014.³⁴ This disruption combined with a general lack of

²⁷ OCHA Humanitarian Needs Overview 2019.

²⁸ World Bank. Libya's Economic Outlook – April 2018 <https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/libya/publication/economic-outlook-april-2018>.

²⁹ OCHA, Libya COVID-19 Situation Report, 13 April 2020.

³⁰ <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/middle-east/libya-war-coronavirus-north-africa-un-haftar-covid-19-a9426146.html>

³¹ REACH, Libya COVID-19 Market Assessment, April 2020.

³² Q Elfagehia, (2014). An Overview of Grains and Feed Market in Libya (Presentation). 2014 IGC Grains Conference. Accessed on 8 October 2017. Available from <http://sacota.co.za/wp-content/uploads/elfagehia.pdf>.

³³ The Minimum Expenditure Basket (MEB) represents the minimum culturally adjusted group of items required to support a six-person Libyan household for one month. The cost of the MEB can be used as a proxy for the financial burdens facing households in different locations.

³⁴ REACH, Market Systems in Libya: Assessment of the Wheat Flour, Insulin, Tomato and Soap Supply Chains, October 2017.

liquidity among the population has led to an estimated 50% decrease in wheat flour consumption since 2014, while bread prices have risen by 300%.³⁵ In July 2018, this situation led to bakeries closing in Tripoli and southern Libya and bread shortages reported across the country.³⁶ Such events reveal that the supply chain is vulnerable to changes in the market environment and disruptions that can limit the availability and affordability of bread for consumers.

Given how integral wheat is to the country's food security, this assessment seeks to produce up to date information on the structure and functionality of the supply chain, as well as what impact the COVID-19 health crisis is currently having. These findings will provide important information for humanitarian actors seeking to mitigate the economic impact of the crisis and alleviate the needs of people in Libya.

3. Methodology

3.1. Methodology overview

The methodology will have two components:

- (1) The first will be a review of existing data already collected by REACH in January 2020, to zoom in on the areas relevant to mapping the supply chain, exploring the capacity of key actors and understanding the potential causes of supply disruptions. The initial data collection included interviews conducted in al Kufra and Benghazi with wheat importers, domestic wheat producers, mill owners/workers, bakery owners/workers, retailers, jam'iyat³⁷ owners/workers, consumers and expert Key Informants (KIs) – such as government officials, academics and economists.
- (2) The second will be additional semi-structured Key Informant interviews with individuals already interviewed as part of the original research to understand what impact the emerging COVID-19 health crisis is having on the supply chain, while relying on findings from the initial data collection as baseline information when deemed relevant. Specifically, for the purposes of the additional data collection, 10 KI interviews will be conducted from 7 to 13 of May 2020 in Benghazi.

3.2. Population of interest

The previous data collection was carried out in Benghazi and al Kufra, and therefore, focuses on the east of the country. However, as this is a national level supply chain, and data was collected from multiple high-level supply chain actors and subject-matter experts the findings will also speak to national level dynamics.

The assessment is interested in an economic process, including the different actors involved in the bread and wheat flour supply chain (e.g., wheat importers, wholesalers, retailers, and jam'iyat.) as well as the population (consumers) who rely on that supply chain in order to access bread and wheat flour, the mainstay of their diet. Alongside this, the assessment is also interested in national-level actors such as wheat importers, mill owners and government officials, in order to understand national-level supply chain dynamics. This approach will allow for an understanding of how both macro- and micro-economic factors impact the supply chain and provide information on each stage of the process, from importation or production through to consumption.

3.3. Secondary data review

The secondary data to be used for this assessment covers three broad areas: previous REACH assessments; previous external market assessments and analyses; recent reports related to the economic impact of COVID-19 in Libya. These are detailed below.

³⁵ REACH, Market Systems in Libya: Assessment of the Wheat Flour, Insulin, Tomato and Soap Supply Chains, October 2017.

³⁶ Reuters, "bread price hike sharpens economic pain for Libyans", July 11 2018

<https://www.reuters.com/article/us-libya-security-economy/bread-price-hike-sharpens-economic-pain-for-libyans-idUSKBN1K22P8>; Libya Herald, "Bread Prices Discussed by Serraj Government As Prices Soar", 9 August <https://www.libyaherald.com/2018/08/09/bread-crisis-discussed-by-serraj-government-as-prices-soar/>

³⁷ Jam'iyat are consumers associations where the population can access subsidised goods provided by the Public Stability Fund (PSF). Prior to the conflict Jam'iyat stores were located in every neighbourhood. REACH, "Market Systems in Libya", October 2017. Their current functionality, however, is not fully known.

Previous REACH assessments:

- [“Market Systems in Libya: Assessment of the Wheat Flour, Insulin, Tomato and Soap Supply Chains”](#) (October, 2017)
- [“Joint Market Monitoring Initiative: January-June 2018 Trends Analysis”](#) (September, 2018)
- [“Joint Market Monitoring Initiative: Monthly Factsheet”](#) (2017 – present)
- [“Desk Review of Cash and Market Studies in Libya”](#) (2017)
- [“Effects of the Tripoli Conflict on South Libya”](#) (June 2019)
- [“2018 Multi-Sector Needs Assessment”](#) (February 2019)
- [“Tripoli Rapid Situation Overview”](#) (April 2019)
- [“Murzuq Rapid Situation Overview”](#) (August 2019)

Previous market assessments and analyses:

- [“Rapid Markets Assessment: Eastern Libya”](#), WFP (August 2011)
- [“Emergency Market Mapping Analysis: Report on the Wheat Flour and Tomato Market Systems, Eastern Libya”](#), WFP (June, 2011)
- [“Libya – Food Security: Multi-Cluster Needs Assessment”](#), WFP (December, 2018)
- “Libya Country Economic Review”, USAID (January, 2019)
- [“Agriculture and Rural Livelihoods Needs Assessment”](#) – Libya, FAO (August 2017)
- [“The Quest For Subsidy Reform in Libya”](#), World Bank (March, 2015)
- [“Libya – Fezzan Agriculture and Livelihood Needs Assessment Report”](#) - WFP (March, 2020)

New literature on economic impact of COVID-19 in Libya

- [“Libya COVID-19 Rapid Market Assessment”](#), REACH (April 2020 – ongoing)
- [“Libya: COVID-19 Situation Report”](#), (April 2020 – ongoing)
- [“Impact of covid-19 on food security & livelihoods”](#), Libya Food Security Sector (April, 2020)

Use of pre-existing REACH data

The previous data collected by REACH was carried out using semi-structured interviews with actors throughout the supply chain, identified for each category through a mixture of purposive sampling and snowballing. For this revised assessment, analysis of that data will focus in on the areas most relevant to understanding supply chain dynamics, potential disruptions to supply, and what possible impact the COVID-19 Health Crisis could have on the supply chain.

In order to do this, the focus will be narrowed down to the data collected from several key supply chain actors and subject-matter experts who will allow us to map the chain, understand its dynamics and vulnerabilities:

National Level Respondent - Importers: Importer interviews will provide us with indicative nationwide and regional information on the importation of wheat flour in Libya, such as the origin of the wheat, the entry points, how the importation process works, and any potential vulnerabilities to disruptions in supply. At the current time, this information will be particularly important for appreciating what impact global-level and national-level crises are having the supply chain.

National Level Respondent - Mill owners: As most of Libya’s wheat is imported and milled locally, mill owners are a vital part of the supply chain and can provide both further information connected to the importation of wheat flour as well as its distribution to actors further down the supply chain, and any potential issues with milling capacity in the country.

Local Level Respondent – Wholesalers: Wholesalers are largely responsible for the movement of wheat goods and their distribution across the country. Although these respondents were interviewed in specific locations (namely Benghazi and al Kufra) the data they provided will still enhance the understanding of the structure of the supply chain and any potential causes of disruption to supply.

Local level respondent – Bakeries: Towards the end of the supply chain, data provided by bakeries will provide further information on any disruptions to supply alongside the availability and affordability of bread for consumers.

Experts: Alongside, data collected from several “experts”, including officials, academics and representatives of organisations involved in the supply chain, will be used.

Interviews with these respondents were wide ranging, however for the purposes of this assessment we will focus in on information concerning the structure and functionality of the supply chain, which can serve a baseline when analysing the additional data gathered through key informant interview.

3.4. Primary Data Collection

Primary data collection will consist of semi-structured interviews with select Key Informants to understand what impact the COVID-19 health crisis is having on the supply chain (in terms of supply and the functionality of supply chain actors) and what actions (if any) are being taken to ensure that bread remains available and affordable in Libya. The KIs³⁸ will consist of actors further up the supply chain (importers, mill owners, bakery owners and wholesalers) and expert respondents, who can provide a national-level overview of what changes have taken place within the supply chain in the wake of COVID-19.

These respondents have already been identified through the previous assessment. Given the current circumstances and current health concerns, they will be contacted remotely over the telephone by REACH enumerators who will have received a short remote training over Skype on the new tool and component of the assessment.

3.5. Data Processing & Analysis

Following each interview, the notes will be translated and shared with the REACH office (currently in work from home modality) in Tunis where they will be cleaned on a daily basis – checked for any inconsistencies, mistakes or lack of clarity – and added to a centralised dataset for each respondent group and each location. Data processing will be carried out by two Assessment Officers (AOs) in adherence to IMPACT Initiatives’ Data Cleaning Minimum Standards Checklist.

The analysis of both the existing datasets and additional data will proceed using thematic coding. When relevant and enriching, a comparative analysis of findings from both data collections – using the initial data as a baseline and juxtaposing it with the incoming data for – will be conducted to capture potential variations in the functionality of the supply chain as a result of the COVID-19 crisis. Incoming data will be analysed using the software Microsoft Excel through which, a Data Saturation Grid will be generated. Coding will be carried out on the basis of the following criteria:

- **Frequency:** the analysis will take into account the number of times a piece of information was reported by respondents. Given the non-probability nature of the sample, these findings will be considered indicative only.
- **Specificity:** while taking into account the bias of respondents, interviews which contain more detailed accounts with information that can be verified through secondary sources will be treated as more relevant if contradicting with other information collected during primary data collection.

³⁸ 15 KIs will be selected among those previously interviewed based on the level of specificity and extensiveness of the answers they provided during the initial data collection.

4. Data Analysis Plan

Below is the follow-up questionnaire to be used for the data collection beginning 07 May 2020, related to the impact of the COVID-19 Health crisis on the wheat flour and bread supply chain in Libya:

Research questions	SUBQ#	Questionnaire QUESTION	Options/Prompt	Data collection method	Key disaggregations (Group types)
Introductory text		<p>Introduce yourself to the interviewee and explain the assessment:</p> <p>Hello, my name is [enumerator name]. Thank you for taking the time to speak to me today. We have previously conducted an interview with you for an assessment of the wheat flour and bread supply chain for the World Food Programme (WFP) aiming to better understand how the wheat flour and bread supply chain works, how consumers access bread and how this has been altered by the conflict.</p> <p>In light of the onset of the COVID-19 crisis (also known as Coronavirus) and the consequent measures implemented by the authorities, we are conducting follow-up interviews with select respondents to understand what impact the health crisis is having on the wheat flour and bread supply chain, in order to help develop an evidence-based response and provide support to interventions in Libya responding to the evolving crisis.</p> <p>During the interview, I will ask you questions about how you operate in the current bread and wheat flour market environment and how/if the ongoing COVID-19 Health crisis impacted your business.</p> <p>Please note that the information you provide will be written down and, combined with findings from the previously conducted interviews, will be used in a report about the wheat flour and bread supply chain dynamics and the impact of the ongoing health crisis on this supply chain. However, the information you provide will remain confidential and your name will not be shared.</p> <p>Clarifications:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Throughout the interview, whenever I refer to the onset of the COVID-19 Health crisis, I am referring to the period following the 19th of March 2020, when the first preventative measures to curb the spread of the virus were implemented by the Libyan authorities, including the imposition of curfews, movement restrictions, the banning of all gatherings and the closure of border crossing points. Please make sure to use this date as a reference point whenever I ask you about the impact of the ongoing crisis on your business. The supply chain is the network of actors, resources and processes involved in the production, importation, transportation, distribution and consumption of bread and wheat flour. <p>Do you consent to this interview? Yes/No</p> <p>Do you have any questions before we begin?</p>			N/A

	N/A	Code of previous interview with the respondent	Interview code	KI	N/A
Basic Information	N/A	Respondent type	Importer Mill Owner Wholesaler Bakery Owner	KI	N/A
	N/A	Type of company	Private without government support (run by private individuals for profit not supporting by the government) Private with government support (run by private individuals for profit but supporting by the government) Public (run by the authorities using public money)	KI	N/A
	N/A	Location of Business	Enter specific location	KI	N/A
	N/A	Date of Interview	Enter date	KI	N/A
What impact has the COVID-19 Health Crisis had on the Bread and	1.1	Where does the wheat grain/wheat flour you currently buy come from?	Which countries? (for importers) Which suppliers? The PSF Private wholesalers	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)

Wheat Flour Supply chain?	1.2	Has this changed since the onset of the COVID-19 crisis (19/03/2020)?	Yes/No	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	1.3	<p>If yes, why has this changed?</p> <p><i>Prompt:</i></p> <p><i>My previous supplier(s) stopped operating</i></p> <p><i>The wheat from my previous supplier was no longer regularly available</i></p> <p><i>There were issues with transportation/logistics</i></p> <p><i>The wheat from my previous supplier(s) was too expensive</i></p> <p><i>I do not know</i></p> <p><i>Other, please specify</i></p>	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	1.4	<p>If yes, how has this changed?</p> <p><i>Prompt:</i></p> <p><i>I changed suppliers (Please explain)</i></p> <p><i>I started dealing with other supplier(s), in addition to my previous one(s)</i></p> <p><i>I stopped procuring wheat grain/flour (Please explain why)</i></p> <p><i>Other, please specify</i></p>	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	2.1.1	How has demand on wheat grain/flour /bread changed since the onset of the COVID-19 crisis (19/03/2020)?	<p>Increased</p> <p>Decreased</p> <p>Stayed the same</p>	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)

	2.1.2	If decreased or increased, what impact (if any) has this had on your business?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	2.1.3	If decreased or increased, why do you think this is?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	3.1.1	Since the onset of the COVID-19 crisis (19/03/2020), have there been any disruptions to the supply of wheat grain/flour?	Yes/No	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	3.1.2	If so, when exactly have these disruptions started?	Start date	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	3.1.3	If so, did these disruption stop occurring (please provide end date) or are they still ongoing?	End date Ongoing	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	3.1.4	If so, what caused these disruptions?	Shortages in the supply chain due to COVID-19 COVID-19-related Movement restrictions Lack of staff/labour due to COVID-19 Lack of vehicles due to COVID-19 Non- COVID-19 related disruptions during this	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)

		<p>timeframe, please specify</p> <p>I do not know</p> <p>Other COVID-19 related disruptions, please specify</p>		
3.1.5	If so, what impact (if any) did/do these disruptions have on your business?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
3.2.1	<p>[ASK TO BAKERY AND MILL OWNERS ONLY]</p> <p>Since the onset of the COVID-19 crisis (19/03/2020), have there been any disruptions to the supply of subsidized wheat provided by the price stability fund?</p>	<p>Yes</p> <p>No</p> <p>I don't know, I don't receive subsidized flour.</p>	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
3.2.2	If so, when exactly have these disruptions started?	Start date	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
3.2.3	If so, did these disruption stop occurring (please provide end date) or are they still ongoing?	<p>End date</p> <p>Ongoing</p>		By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
3.2.4	If so, what caused these disruptions?	<p>Shortages in the supply chain of subsidized flour due to COVID-19</p> <p>COVID-19-related Movement restrictions</p> <p>Lack of staff/labour due to COVID-19</p> <p>Lack of vehicles due to COVID-19</p>	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)

		<p>Non- COVID-19 related disruptions during this timeframe, please specify</p> <p>I do not know</p> <p>Other COVID-19 related disruptions, please specify</p>		
3.2.4	If so, what impact (if any) did/do these disruptions have on your business?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
4.1	Do current policies and restrictions implemented to prevent the spread of COVID-19 (such as closure of borders, curfews, bans on intercity travel, and bans on gatherings) affect the transportation of the goods you need?	Yes/No	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
4.2	If so, how do current policies and restrictions effect the transportation of goods?	<p>They prevent goods from being delivered</p> <p>They cause me to have goods delivered less often</p> <p>They cause me to have goods delivered in smaller quantities</p> <p>They increase the price of deliveries</p> <p>They have no impact</p> <p>I do not know</p> <p>Other, please specify</p>	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
4.3	If so, what impact (if any) does this have on your business?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)

	5.1	Are there any current problems with the key infrastructure (electricity, water, roads) that you depend upon?	Yes/No	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	5.2	If so, with which infrastructure?	Electricity Water Road Other, please specify	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	5.3	What are these problems? Please specify for each infrastructure type chosen.	Open ended		
	5.4	What impact do they have on your business?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	6.1.1	Is the current security situation impacting your business (Prompt: Checkpoints; hijackings; robberies)?	Yes/No	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
	6.1.2	If yes, what are these security incidents?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)

6.1.3	If yes, what impact (if any) has this had on your business?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
7.1	Since the onset of the COVID-19 crisis, has there been sufficient labour to help run your business?	Yes/No	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
7.2	If no, why not?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
7.3	If no, what impact (if any) has this had on your business?	Open ended	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
8.1	At what price (in LYD) do you currently buy one metric tonne (for importers) / 50 KG (for the rest) of wheat grain/flour?		KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
8.2.1	[ASK TO ALL RESPONDENTS EXCEPT BAKERY OWNERS] At what price (in LYD) do you currently sell one metric tonne/50 KG (quantity depends on actor) of wheat flour/grain?		KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)

8.2.2	[ASK ONLY TO BAKERY OWNERS] With 1 LYD how many pieces of bread can a consumer buy in your bakery?		KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
9.	If supplies of wheat stopped tomorrow, how long would your current stores last?	Less than 3 days; 3-7 days; Two weeks; Three weeks; One month; Two months; Three months; Six months; More than six months.	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
10.1	What measures (if any) have been introduced to help support the bread and Wheat flour supply chain and ensure that bread remains affordable and available for consumers?		KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
10.1.1	[If aware of measures being implemented] Who introduced these measures?	The ministry of economy The PSF The ministry of interior The bakers union Other, please specify I don't know	KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
10.1.2	[If aware of measures being implemented] So far, how efficient do you think these measures have been? Please explain your answer.		KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)
11.	Are there any issues or challenges you are currently facing when carrying out your work that has not been captured through this survey?		KI	By respondent type (which supply chain actor)